JT gravity with defects and 3D gravity Based on [2006.11317] with Joaquin Turiaci

Henry Maxfield, University of California, Santa Barbara



See also [2006.13414] Witten

Strings 2020



JT gravity wit and 3D gravit Based on [2006.11317] with Joaquin Turiaci

Henry Maxfield, University of California, Santa Barbara



See also [2006.13414] Witten

Strings 2020



The gravitational path integral How much can a semiclassical theory tell us?

Two simple case studies

The gravitational path integral How much can a semiclassical theory tell us?

Two simple case studies:

3D pure gravity:

Construct partition function from sum over saddle points [MaloneyWitten][KellerMaloney] **A problem:** negative density of states near extremal BTZ [BenjaminOoguriShaoWang] Aim 1: a solution within pure gravity



The gravitational path integral How much can a semiclassical theory tell us?

Two simple case studies:

3D pure gravity:

Construct partition function from sum over saddle points [MaloneyWitten][KellerMaloney] **A problem:** negative density of states near extremal BTZ [BenjaminOoguriShaoWang] Aim 1: a solution within pure gravity

2D Jackiw-Teitelboim gravity: [SaadShenkerStanford] Exact path integral: includes topologies with no classical solutions A new paradigm for AdS/CFT duality: an *ensemble* of dual Hamiltonians $\operatorname{Prob}(H) \propto e^{-L\operatorname{Tr} V(H)}$ Aim 2: generalise the JT — matrix integral duality





Pure 3D gravity & Kaluza-Klein instantons





3D pure gravity Near-extremal BTZ black holes

$$I_{\rm EH} = -\frac{1}{16\pi G_N} \int d^3x \sqrt{g_3} \left(R_3 + \frac{2}{\ell_3^2} \right) - \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2} \right) - \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{1}{2} + \frac{1$$

$$I_{AO} = -\frac{2\pi}{16\pi G_N} \int d^2x \sqrt{g_2} \left(\Phi R_2 - \frac{1}{4} \Phi^3 F^2 + \frac{2}{\ell_3^2} \Phi \right)$$

[Achúcarro, Ortiz]

$$I = -\frac{2\pi}{16\pi G_N} \int d^2 x \sqrt{g_2} \left(\Phi R_2 - \frac{1}{2} (8G_N J)^2 \Phi^{-1} \right)^2 d^2 r d^2 r$$

$$I_{\rm JT} = -S_0\chi - \frac{1}{2}\int d^2x_{\rm V}$$

Low temperature: well-described by AdS_2 physics (bootstrap!)

[Ghosh,HM,Turiaci]







3D geometry: "fill in" a cycle

Near extremal: $\rho_J(E) \sim e^{S_0(J)} \sqrt{E - |J|}$



 AdS_3 Vacuum



BTZ black hole





3D geometry: "fill in" a cycle



E > |J| : extremality bound for rotating BTZ

Near extremal: $\rho_J(E) \sim e^{S_0(J)} \sqrt{E - |J|}$







BTZ black hole

Reduce on φ circle:



Near horizon: $AdS_2 \times S^1$, JT \checkmark





3D geometry: "fill in" a cycle

 $S_0(J) = \frac{\text{Area}}{4G_N} \propto \sqrt{\frac{J}{G_N}}$







BTZ black hole

Reduce on ϕ circle:



Near horizon: $AdS_2 \times S^1$, JT \checkmark

Boundary torus



3D geometry: "fill in" a cycle



 $S_0(J) = \frac{\text{Area}}{4G_N} \propto \sqrt{\frac{J}{G_N}}$

 $SL(2,\mathbb{Z})$ black hole

$\rho_I(E) < 0$ for $E - |J| \leq e^{-S_0/2}!$ [BenjaminOoguriShaoWang]



Near extremal: $\rho_J(E) \sim e^{S_0(J)} \sqrt{E - |J|} + (-1)^J e^{\frac{S_0(J)}{2}} - \frac{1}{\sqrt{E - |J|}}$







BTZ black hole

Reduce on φ circle:



Near horizon: $AdS_2 \times S^1$, JT \checkmark

Boundary torus



3D geometry: "fill in" a cycle



Near extremal: $\rho_J(E) \sim e^{S_0(J)} \sqrt{E - |J|} + (-1)^J e^{\frac{S_0(J)}{2}} - \frac{1}{\sqrt{E - J}}$







BTZ black hole

Reduce on ϕ circle:



Near horizon: $AdS_2 \times S^1$, JT \checkmark

Boundary torus



3D geometry: "fill in" a cycle



Include defects in near-horizon JT theory!





+ ...

$$I_{\rm JT} = -S_0 \chi - \frac{1}{2} \int d^2 x \sqrt{g_2} \phi \left(R_2 + 2\right) - \int_{\partial} ds \, \phi(\kappa - 1)$$

otic boundary circles: $L_{\partial} \to \infty, \, \phi_{\partial} \to \infty, \, \beta = \frac{L_{\partial}}{2\phi_{\partial}}$ held fixed.

Asympto

Notation:

 $\left\langle Z(\beta_1)\cdots Z(\beta_n) \right\rangle =$

n asy reno

$$= \int \mathscr{D}g_{2} \mathscr{D}\phi \, e^{-I_{\rm JT}[g_{2},\phi]}$$
ymptotic boundaries,
rmalised lengths $\beta_{1}, \ldots, \beta_{n}$

$$I_{\rm JT} = -S_0 \chi - \frac{1}{2} \int d^2 x \sqrt{g_2} \phi \left(R_2 + 2\right) - \int_{\partial} ds \, \phi(\kappa - 1)$$

Classical solution: the hyperbolic disc

Perturbative corrections: integrate over possible locations of boundary



 ϕ is a Lagrange multiplier, enforcing $R_2 = -2$

$$I_{\rm JT} = -S_0 \chi - \frac{1}{2} \int d^2 x \sqrt{g_2} \phi \left(R_2 + 2\right) - \int_{\partial} ds \, \phi(\kappa - 1) \begin{bmatrix} \text{(Kitaev)} & \text{[Jensen]} \\ \text{[MaldacenaStanford]} \\ \text{[EngelsöyMertensV]} \end{bmatrix}$$

 ϕ is a Lagrange multiplier, enforcing $R_2 = -2$

Classical solution: the hyperbolic disc

Perturbative corrections: integrate over possible locations of boundary



becomes Schwarzian action







- ϕ is a Lagrange multiplier, enforcing $R_2 = -2$
- **Higher topologies:** path integral \longrightarrow finite-dimensional integral $\int \mathscr{D}g_2 \mathscr{D}\phi \, e^{-I_{\rm JT}[g_2,\phi]} \longrightarrow \int_{\mathscr{M}} \mu_{\rm WP} \qquad \mathscr{M} \text{ is a space of hyperbolic surfaces,} \\ \mu_{\rm WP} \text{ is the Weil-Petersson measure}$

 $Z_{g=1,n=1}(\beta)$. b



$$\left\langle Z(\beta_1)\cdots Z(\beta_n) \right\rangle_{\text{Matrix}} = \int dH e^{-L\operatorname{Tr} V(H)} \left(\operatorname{Tr} e^{-\beta_1 H} \right) \cdots \left(\operatorname{Tr} e^{-\beta_n H} \right)$$

Integral has a genus expansion: ['t Hooft]

$$\left\langle Z(\beta_1)\cdots Z(\beta_n) \right\rangle_{\text{conn.,Matrix}}$$

Topological recursion: all $Z_{g,n}^{\text{Matrix}}(\beta_1, \dots, \beta_n)$ uniquely determined by $Z_{0,1}^{\text{Matrix}}(\beta)$

- $V_{g,n}(b_1, \ldots, b_n)$ obey a recursion relation [Mirzakhani]
- Close relation to "topological recursion": matrix integrals [EynardOrantin]

$$\sum_{g=0}^{\infty} e^{-(2g+n-2)S_0} Z_{g,n}^{\text{Matrix}}(\beta_1, \dots, \beta_n)$$



The matrix integral dual of JT gravity

$$\int dH e^{-L\operatorname{Tr} V(H)} \left(\operatorname{Tr} e^{-\beta_1 H}\right) \cdots \left(\operatorname{Tr} e^{-\beta_n H}\right)$$

Characterised by leading order partition function $Z_{g=0,n=1}^{\text{Matrix}}(\beta)$

All other amplitudes: $Z_{g,n}^{\text{Matrix}}(\beta) \blacktriangleleft$

A correspondence to all orders in genus expansion

Matrix integral = random Hamiltonian of JT boundary theory



Mirzakhani's recursion

Generalise JT: include dynamical defects

Defects appear with amplitude λ Source deficit angle $2\pi(1 - \alpha)$

Integrate over hyperbolic surfaces with *k* cone points

Two-parameter expansion: g=0 k=0



A new special case: g = 0, n = 1, k = 1



Schwarzian integral over elliptic coadjoint orbit



$= Z_{\text{trumpet}}(\beta, b = 2\pi i \alpha)$ [MertensTuriaci]



g=0 k=0



 $Z_{g,n,k}(\beta_1,\dots,\beta_n;\alpha_1,\dots,\alpha_k) = \begin{bmatrix} b_1 db_1 Z_{\text{trumpet}}(\beta_1,b_1) \cdots \end{bmatrix} b_n db_n Z_{\text{trumpet}}(\beta_n,b_n) V_{g,n,k}(b_1,\dots,b_n;\alpha_1,\dots,\alpha_k)$

 $\left\langle Z(\beta_1)\cdots Z(\beta_n)\right\rangle_{\text{conn.}} = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} e^{-(2g+n-2)S_0} \frac{\lambda^k}{k!} Z_{g,n,k}(\beta_1,\cdots,\beta_n;\alpha,\ldots,\alpha)$ $= Z_{\text{trumpet}}(\beta, b)$ $b = V_{g=1,n=1,k=2}(b; \alpha_1, \alpha_2)$ WP volume with cone points

Requires $\alpha \leq \frac{1}{2}$ so a splitting geodesic always exists for $k \geq 2$



Weil-Petersson volumes with conical defects

 $V_{g=1,n=1,k=2}(b;\alpha_1,\alpha_2) = \begin{pmatrix} \gamma^{\alpha_1} \\ \ddots \\ \gamma^{\alpha_2} \end{pmatrix} b$



Weil-Petersson volumes with conical defects

$$V_{g=1,n=1,k=2}(b;\alpha_1,\alpha_2) = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha_1 \\ \ddots \\ \neg \alpha_2 \\ \neg \alpha_2 \end{pmatrix}$$

$$V_{g,n,k}(b_1, \dots, b_n; \alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_k) = V_{g,n+k}(b_1, \dots, b_n, 2\pi i \alpha_1, \dots, 2\pi i \alpha_k)$$

(Proven for $\alpha \leq \frac{1}{2}$)



Defect ~ imaginary length

- Usual WP volumes with boundaries of imaginary length! [TanWongZhang][DoNorbury]
 - Used recently for dS_2 : [CotlerJensenMaloney]





Start by only allowing topologies with classical solutions: just two!

Is $\lambda < 0$ inconsistent? $\rho < 0$ for $0 < E < |\lambda|$

 $\rho_{\text{naive}}(E) = e^{S_0} \left[\frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \sinh\left(2\pi\sqrt{E}\right) + \frac{\lambda}{2\pi\sqrt{E}} \cosh\left(2\pi\alpha\sqrt{E}\right) \right] \sim \frac{e^{S_0}}{2\pi} \left[\sqrt{E} + \frac{\lambda}{\sqrt{E}} \right]$

Start by only allowing topologies with classical solutions: just two!

$$\rho_{\text{naive}}(E) = e^{S_0} \left[\frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \sinh\left(2\pi\sqrt{E}\right) + \frac{\lambda}{2\pi\sqrt{E}} \cosh\left(2\pi\alpha\sqrt{E}\right) \right] \sim \frac{e^{S_0}}{2\pi} \left[\sqrt{E} + \frac{\lambda}{\sqrt{E}} \right]$$

Is $\lambda < 0$ inconsistent? $\rho < 0$ for $0 < E < |\lambda|$

Include multiple defects:

Expansion in defects divergent for $E \leq |\lambda|$



Lea

eading order for
$$k$$
 defects at low energy: $V_{g=0,n=1,k} \sim \frac{1}{(k-2)!} \left(\frac{b^2}{2}\right)^{k-2}$ $(b \gg 1)$
Sum: $\rho_{\text{disc}}(E) \sim \frac{e^{S_0}}{2\pi} \left[\sqrt{E} + \frac{\lambda}{\sqrt{E}} - \frac{\lambda^2}{2E^{3/2}} + \cdots\right] \sim \frac{e^{S_0}}{2\pi} \sqrt{E+2\lambda}, \quad E \sim \lambda \ll 1$

Shift of threshold: $E > E_0(\lambda) \sim -2\lambda$

Lea

adding order for
$$k$$
 defects at low energy: $V_{g=0,n=1,k} \sim \frac{1}{(k-2)!} \left(\frac{b^2}{2}\right)^{k-2}$ $(b \gg 1)$
Sum: $\rho_{\text{disc}}(E) \sim \frac{e^{S_0}}{2\pi} \left[\sqrt{E} + \frac{\lambda}{\sqrt{E}} - \frac{\lambda^2}{2E^{3/2}} + \cdots \right] \sim \frac{e^{S_0}}{2\pi} \sqrt{E - E_0(\lambda)}, \quad E \sim \lambda \ll 1$
which of threshold: $E > E_0(\lambda) = -2\lambda - 2\pi^2(1 - 2\alpha^2)\lambda^2 - \frac{2}{3}\pi^4(5 - 18\alpha^2 + 15\alpha^4)\lambda^3 + 6\lambda^4)$
is polynomials! $V_{g=0,n=1,k} = \frac{1}{(k-2)!} \left(\frac{b^2}{2}\right)^{k-2} + \#b^{2(k-3)} + \cdots + \#b^4 + \#b^2 + \#$
First $k - 3$ terms fixed by lower orders

Sh

Strong volume



New contribution to E_0 at order λ^k



An alternative way to write the disc density of states:

 $\left\langle Z(\beta) \right\rangle_{g=0} = -$

$u(x) \iff$ genus zero $\rho(E)$: defines a matrix integral

For JT: u(x) implicitly from $\frac{1}{2\pi}\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}$

Inverse Laplace, change variables:

 $\rho_{\rm disc}$

Threshold $E_0 = u(0)$,

[BanksDouglasSeibergShenker],... [Okuyama,Sakai][Johnson]

$$\frac{e^{S_0}}{\sqrt{4\pi\beta}}\int_0^\infty dx\,e^{-\beta u(x)}$$

$$\overline{x}$$
 $I_1\left(2\pi\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right) = x$ "string equation"

$$E) = \frac{e^{S_0}}{2\pi} \int_{E_0}^E \frac{du}{\sqrt{E-u}} \frac{dx}{du}$$

 $\rho_{\rm disc} \sim \sqrt{E - E_0}$ (generically)



$$V_{0,n}(b_1, \dots, b_n) = \frac{1}{2} \left(-\frac{\partial}{\partial x} \right)^{n-3}$$

An explicit expression for genus zero WP volumes [MertensTuriaci]: $\int_{r=0}^{n-3} \left[J_0\left(b_1\sqrt{u_{\mathrm{JT}}(x)}\right) \cdots J_0\left(b_n\sqrt{u_{\mathrm{JT}}(x)}\right) u_{\mathrm{JT}}'(x) \right] \bigg|_{r=0}$

$$V_{0,n,k}(b_1,\ldots,b_n;\alpha_1,\ldots,\alpha_k) = \frac{1}{2} \left(-\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right)^{k+n-3} \left[J_0\left(b_1\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)\cdots J_0\left(b_n\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_1\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)\cdots I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_k\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)u_{\rm JT}'(x)\right]$$

An explicit expression for genus zero WP volumes with defects:

Explicit expression for $Z_{0,1,k}(\beta; \alpha)$ for all k

Perform sum over k using "Lagrange reversion theorem"



$$V_{0,n,k}(b_1,\ldots,b_n;\alpha_1,\ldots,\alpha_k) = \frac{1}{2} \left(-\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right)^{k+n-3} \left[J_0\left(b_1\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)\cdots J_0\left(b_n\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_1\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)\cdots I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_k\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)u_{\rm JT}'(x)\right]$$

Explicit expression for $Z_{0,1,k}(\beta; \alpha)$ for all k

Perform sum over k using "Lagrange reversion theorem"

Lagrange reversion theorem

From Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia

In mathematics, the Lagrange reversion theorem gives series or formal po

Let v be a function of x and y in terms of another function f such that

$$v = x + yf(v)$$

Then for any function *g*, for small enough *y*:

$$g(v) = g(x) + \sum_{k=1}^\infty rac{y^k}{k!} igg(rac{\partial}{\partial x}igg)^{k-1} \left(f(x)^k g'(x)
ight).$$

An explicit expression for genus zero WP volumes with defects:



$$V_{0,n,k}(b_1,\ldots,b_n;\alpha_1,\ldots,\alpha_k) = \frac{1}{2} \left(-\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right)^{k+n-3} \left[J_0\left(b_1\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)\cdots J_0\left(b_n\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_1\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)\cdots I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_k\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)u_{\rm JT}'(x)\right]$$

Explicit expression for $Z_{0,1,k}(\beta; \alpha)$ for all k

Perform sum over k using "Lagrange reversion theorem"

Lagrange reversion theorem

From Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia

In mathematics, the Lagrange reversion theorem gives series or formal po

Let v be a function of x and y in terms of another function f such that

$$v = x + yf(v)$$
 Strip

Then for any function *g*, for small enough *y*:

$$g(v) = g(x) + \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{y^k}{k!} \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right)^{k-1} \left(f(x)^k g'(x)\right) \cdot \mathbf{Sum \ over \ defects}$$

An explicit expression for genus zero WP volumes with defects:

ng equation



$$V_{0,n,k}(b_1,\ldots,b_n;\alpha_1,\ldots,\alpha_k) = \frac{1}{2} \left(-\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right)^{k+n-3} \left[J_0\left(b_1\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)\cdots J_0\left(b_n\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_1\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)\cdots I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_k\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)u_{\rm JT}'(x)\right]$$

 $\mathcal{U}(x)$ $\cdot I_1 \left(2\pi \sqrt{u(}$ 2π

An explicit expression for genus zero WP volumes with defects:

- Explicit expression for $Z_{0,1,k}(\beta; \alpha)$ for all k
- Perform sum over k using "Lagrange reversion theorem"
 - Result: a linear deformation of the string equation!

$$\overline{(x)}\right) + \lambda I_0\left(2\pi\alpha\sqrt{u(x)}\right) = x$$



$$V_{0,n,k}(b_1,\ldots,b_n;\alpha_1,\ldots,\alpha_k) = \frac{1}{2} \left(-\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right)^{k+n-3} \left[J_0\left(b_1\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)\cdots J_0\left(b_n\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_1\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)\cdots I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_k\sqrt{u_{\rm JT}(x)}\right)u_{\rm JT}'(x)\right]$$

$$\frac{\sqrt{u(x)}}{2\pi} I_1\left(2\pi\sqrt{u(x)}\right) + \sum_i \lambda_i I_0\left(2\pi\alpha_i\sqrt{u(x)}\right) = x$$

An explicit expression for genus zero WP volumes with defects:

- Explicit expression for $Z_{0,1,k}(\beta; \alpha)$ for all k
- Perform sum over k using "Lagrange reversion theorem"
 - Result: a linear deformation of the string equation!

Exact genus zero density of states



The matrix integral dual The double trumpet: a smoking gun

Two boundaries: double-scaled matrix integrals have a *universal* genus 0 answer:

 $\left\langle Z(\beta_1)Z(\beta_2) \right\rangle_{\text{conn.,g=0,M}}$



$$f_{\text{atrix}} = \frac{1}{2\pi} \frac{\sqrt{\beta_1 \beta_2}}{\beta_1 + \beta_2} e^{-E_0(\beta_1 + \beta_2)}$$

gives precisely this answer, order by order in λ !

The matrix integral dual The double trumpet: a smoking gun

Two boundaries: double-scaled matrix integrals have a *universal* genus 0 answer:

$$\left\langle Z(\beta_1) Z(\beta_2) \right\rangle_{\text{conn.,g=0,}}$$



Proof that topological recursion is obeyed using deformation theorem of [Eynard, Orantin]

Matrix =
$$\frac{1}{2\pi} \frac{\sqrt{\beta_1 \beta_2}}{\beta_1 + \beta_2} e^{-E_0(\beta_1 + \beta_2)}$$

gives precisely this answer, order by order in λ !

Explicit checks for $Z_{g=0,n,k}$, and some at higher genus: all match matrix integral!

As a deformation of dilaton potential The "defect gas"

Defect: insertion in path integral

Integrate out dilaton: imposes delta-function curvature $I_{\rm JT} \longrightarrow -\frac{1}{2} \left[d^2 x \sqrt{g_2} \phi \left(R_2 + 2 - 4\pi (1 - \alpha) \delta_{\rm defect} \right) \implies R_2 = -2 + 4\pi (1 - \alpha) \delta_{\rm defect} \right]$

Conical singularity at location of defect \checkmark

$$\int \mathscr{D}g_2 \mathscr{D}\phi \, e^{-I_{\rm JT}[g_2,\phi]} \int d^2x \sqrt{g_2} e^{-2\pi(1-\alpha)\phi(x)}$$

Defect insertion



As a deformation of dilaton potential The "defect gas"

Sum over defect $\sum_{k=1}^{k} \frac{\lambda^{k}}{k!} \int \mathscr{D}g_{2}^{k}$

Exponentiates: extra local term in action

$$I = -\frac{1}{2} \int d^2 x \sqrt{g_2} \left(\phi R_2 + U(\phi) \right)$$

A family of dilaton gravity theories with matrix integral duals

$$\mathscr{D}\phi \, e^{-I_{\mathrm{JT}}[g_2,\phi]} \left(\int d^2x \sqrt{g_2} e^{-2\pi(1-\alpha)\phi(x)} \right)^k$$

$$U(\phi) = 2\phi + \sum_{i} \Lambda_{i} e^{-2\pi(1-\alpha_{i})\phi}$$

JT with defects Summary

- For N_F "flavours" of defect, $2N_F$ parameters λ_i, α_i
- Exact formula for disc density of states
- Matrix integral to all orders in the genus expansion



Exact path integral for JT gravity generalises to models with defects

• Dilaton gravity with deformed potential $U(\phi) = 2\phi + \sum_{i} \Lambda_{i} e^{-2\pi(1-\alpha_{i})\phi}$

Back to three dimensions

Back to three dimensions A proposal to cure negative density of states

Near-extremal density of primary states well-described by JT + KK instantons!

Negativity: $\rho_J(E) \sim e^{S_0(J)} \sqrt{E - |J|}$ -

replaced by nonperturbative shift of BTZ extremality bound:

 $E_0(J) - |J|$

Multiple KK instantons in 2D \longrightarrow Seifert manifolds in 3D

New topologies to include in path integral, with no classical solutions

A similar perturbative shift of BTZ extremality for generic CFTs (bootstrap) [HM]

$$+ (-1)^{J} e^{\frac{S_{0}(J)}{2}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{E - |J|}} \longrightarrow e^{S_{0}(J)} \sqrt{E - E_{0}(J)}$$

$$\sim -(-1)^{J}e^{-\frac{S_{0}(J)}{2}}$$

Back to three dimensions An ensemble dual for 3D pure gravity?

- "Spacetime wormholes": gravity joins disconnected Euclidean boundaries
- An ensemble of dual CFTs?!
- A reason to expect continuous $\rho_I(E)$
- Closely related to recent discussions of Page curve...
- A new paradigm: semiclassical gravity as an averaged theory?

[Cotler, Jensen] [Belin, de Boer] [MaloneyWitten][Afkhami-Jeddi,Cohn,Hartman,Tajdini]

A matrix integral near extremality, but more structure from locality, correlators

[Penington][AlmheiriEngelhardtMarolfHM][PeningtonShenkerStanfordYang][AlmheiriHartmanMaldacenaShaghoulianTajdini]

... and the Hilbert space of closed "baby" universes [Coleman][GiddingsStrominger][MarolfHM]

