On the ubiquity of meta-stable vacua

Hiroshi Ooguri (Caltech)
Last year, Intriligator, Seiberg and Shih discovered that supersymmetric QCD with massive flavors has meta-stable vacua when $N_c < N_f < \frac{3N_c}{2}$.

This raises various questions:

-- How generic is this phenomenon?

-- Is it useful for model building?

-- Can we realize it in string theory?

-- How does the story change when the gravity is turned on?
How generic is this phenomenon?
This is about N=1 theories obtained by perturbing N=2 theories with superpotentials.

Consider an arbitrary N=2 gauge theory.

Choose a generic point $p$ on the Coulomb branch.

\[ \chi \text{ massless monopole} \quad \chi \text{ massless dyon} \quad \chi \quad p \]

\textit{e.g. pure SU(2) theory}
Perturbed Seiberg-Witten theories

Ookouchi, Park + H.O.
(0704.3613)

One can find a superpotential $W$ which generates a meta-stable vacuum at $p$.  

![Graph](image_url)

*e.g. pure SU(2) theory*

- massless monopole
- massless dyon
- $x$
- $p$
This follows from the positivity of the sectional curvature on the Coulomb branch.

In general, in geodesic coordinates:

\[ g_{ij}(z) = g_{ij}(0) + R_{ij-kl} z^k \bar{z}^l + \ldots \]
This follows from the positivity of the sectional curvature on the Coulomb branch.

In general, in geodesic coordinates:

\[ g^{ij}(z) = g^{ij}(0) + R^{ij}_{k\bar{l}} z^k \bar{z}^\bar{l} + \ldots \]

Choose \( W = k_i z^i \), where \( \dot{z}^i(0) = 0 \) and \( k_i \) is a constant vector.

\[
\nabla = g^{ij} \partial_i W \partial_j W = g^{ij}(0) k_i k_j + R^{ij}_{k\bar{l}} k_i \bar{k_j} z^k \bar{z}^\bar{l} + \ldots
\]

\[ \text{positive definite} \]
This follows from the positivity of the sectional curvature on the Coulomb branch.

In general, in geodesic coordinates:

$$g_{i\bar{j}}(z) = g_{i\bar{j}}(0) + R_{i\bar{j}k\bar{l}} \, z^k \bar{z}^\ell + \ldots$$

Choose $\mathcal{W} = k_i z^i$, where $z^i(p) = 0$ and $k_i$ is a constant vector.

$$\nabla = g^{i\bar{j}} \partial_i \mathcal{W} \, \bar{\partial}_j \mathcal{W}$$

$$= g^{i\bar{j}}(0) k_i k_j + R^{i\bar{j}k\bar{l}} k_i k_j \, z^k \bar{z}^\ell + \ldots$$

pos. def. The positivity is a consequence of the rigid limit of special geometry:

$$g_{i\bar{j}} = \text{Im} \, \partial_i \partial_j \hat{F}$$
For gauge group $G = SU(2)$ or $SU(3)$, one can choose $W$ to be a single-trace operator. Such deformation can be realized in string theory. Cachazo, Intriligator, Vafa (hep-th/0103067)
For gauge group $G = SU(2)$ or $SU(3)$, one can choose $W$ to be a single-trace operator.

Such deformation can be realized in string theory.

Cachazo, Intriligator, Vafa
(hep-th/0103067)

If the curvature is zero or negative, the potential $V$ has no local minimum with $V > 0$ for any choice of superpotential $W$.

Genericity argument can fail.
For gauge group $G = SU(2)$ or $SU(3)$, one can choose $W$ to be a single-trace operator. Such deformation can be realized in string theory. Cachazo, Intriligator, Vafa (hep-th/0103067)

If the curvature is zero or negative, the potential $V$ has no local minimum with $V > 0$ for any choice of superpotential $W$. **Genericity argument can fail.**

If we turn on gravity, the sectional curvature for vector multiplets in $N=2$ supergravity is not positive definite.
Denef and Douglas (hep-th/0404116) have shown that:

For flux compactification with one modulus, there are no meta-stable de Sitter vacua in the large complex structure region.

Note that the curvature of the moduli space is negative in this region.

Surprizingly, they also found no meta-stable de Sitter vacua even in the conifold region, where the curvature turns positive.
Any quiver gauge theory with adjustable superpotentials for the adjoint fields and masses for the bifundamental fields has meta-stable vacua in some range of its parameters.

Many of these gauge theories have geometric realizations in string theory.

Douglas, Moore
(hep-th/9603167)

Cachazo, Katz, Vafa
(hep-th/0108120)
Consider the following situation:

$\Gamma \Rightarrow \Gamma_1 \xleftarrow{\begin{array}{c} a_{13}^3 \end{array}} \Gamma_2$

$\Gamma'_1$ can be the ISS model or its variant, which has meta-stable vacua.
Consider the following situation:

\[
\Gamma 
\Rightarrow 
\Gamma_1 \quad \text{quiver} \quad \Gamma_2
\]

\(\Gamma_1\) can be the ISS model or its variant, which has meta-stable vacua.

The meta-stable vacua are not disturbed if the interactions through the node 3 are weak.

Note: This argument would not work if we are looking for models without SUSY vacua since small perturbations may generate SUSY vacua.
Consider the following situation:

\[ \Gamma \Rightarrow \Gamma_1 \xrightarrow{O} \Gamma_2 \]

\[ \text{quiver} \]

\( \Gamma_1 \) can be the ISS model or its variant, which has meta-stable vacua.

The meta-stable vacua are not disturbed if the interactions through the node 3 are weak.

The supersymmetry breaking effect can be communicated to \( \Gamma_2 \) by the simple gauge mediation.

\[ W_{\text{messenger}} \sim (m + F \theta^2) Q_{32} Q_{23} \]

\( \langle Q_{31} Q_{13} \rangle \)

SUSY breaking will propagate through the quiver diagram.
Consider the following situation:

\[ \Gamma \quad \Rightarrow \quad \Gamma_1 \to \Gamma_2 \]

\( \Gamma_1 \) can be the ISS model or its variant, which has meta-stable vacua.

The meta-stable vacua are not disturbed if the interactions through the node 3 are weak.

The supersymmetry breaking effect can be communicated to \( \Gamma_2 \) by the simple gauge mediation.

SUSY breaking will propagate through the quiver diagram.

This idea was recently applied to study meta-stable vacua in the \( An \) quiver theories.

Amariti, L.Girardello, Mariotti (0706.3151)
In a large class of field theories, there are long-lived meta-stable vacua for some ranges of parameters.

In contrast, models without SUSY vacua are non-generic.

Difference between $>$ and $=$.
In a large class of field theories, there are **long-lived meta-stable vacua** for some ranges of parameters.

In contrast, **models without SUSY vacua** are non-generic.

Difference between $>$ and $=$.

These field theory models have frozen parameters.

When the gravity is turned on, they become dynamical.

One should worry about stabilizing them in an appropriate range.
Application to Model Building
Application to Model Building

Meta-stability requires $>$ rather than $=$. This simplifies model building.
Constructing models without SUSY vacua is hard.

-- Witten index (e.g., non-zero for SQCD)
-- Nelson-Seiberg theorem on R-symmetry

Realizing them in string theory is harder.
Constructing models without SUSY vacua is hard.

-- Witten index (e.g., non-zero for SQCD)
-- Nelson-Seiberg theorem on R-symmetry

Realizing them in string theory is harder.

Many of the difficulties can be avoided by accepting meta-stability.

-- Witten index and Nelson-Seiberg theorem are not obstructions any more.

-- Greater flexibilities.

e.g., Superpotential can be generic.

In particular, we can break the R-symmetry and generate the gaugino masses at one-loop.
Direct Mediation Model:

Hidden sector fields carry standard model charges.

The ISS model itself is difficult to use since the R-symmetry is unbroken.

How about breaking the R-symmetry explicitly by superpotential?

Kitano, Ookouchi + H.O. (hep-ph/0612139)
Direct Mediation Model:

Hidden sector fields carry standard model charges.

The ISS model itself is difficult to use since the R-symmetry is unbroken.

How about breaking the R-symmetry explicitly by superpotential?

Kitano, Ookouchi + H.O. (hep-ph/0612139)

\[
W_{\text{ISS}} = \sum_{i=1}^{N_f} m_i \, Q_i \tilde{Q}_i \\
\delta W = \sum_{i,j,k,l} C_{ijkl} \, Q_i \tilde{Q}_j \, Q_k \tilde{Q}_l.
\]
Direct Mediation Model:

Hidden sector fields carry standard model charges.

The ISS model itself is difficult to use since the R-symmetry is unbroken.

How about breaking the R-symmetry explicitly by superpotential?

Kitano, Ookouchi + H.O.
(hep-ph/0612139)

\[ W_{\text{ISS}} = \sum_{i=1}^{N_f} m_i \; q_i \tilde{q}_i \]

add

\[ \delta W = \sum_{ijk} C_{ijk} \; q_i \tilde{q}_j \; q_k \tilde{q}_l \]

This model can be naturally realized on D-branes at Calabi-Yau singularities.

Argurio, Bertolini, Franco, Kachru (hep-th/0703236)
We choose: 

\[
(m_i) = (m, \ldots, m, \mu, \ldots, \mu)
\]

appropriate \(C_{ijkl}\)

so that there is a meta-stable vacuum with unbroken global symmetry:

\[
SU(N_F - N_C) \times SU(N_C) \times U(1)
\]

\[
\left\langle Q \bar{Q} \right\rangle_{\text{susy}} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & * \end{pmatrix}^{N_F - N_C}
\]

\[
\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & * \end{pmatrix}^{N_C}
\]
We choose: 

\[
(m_i) = (m, \ldots, m, \mu, \ldots, \mu)
\]

appropriate \(C_{ij\,k\,l}\)

so that there is a meta-stable vacuum with unbroken global symmetry:

\[
SU(N_F - N_C) \times SU(N_C) \times U(1)
\]

\[
\langle \bar{q} q \rangle_{\text{susy}} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & * \end{pmatrix}^{N_F - N_C}
\]

This vacuum is long-lived if:

\[m \gg \mu\]

\(C_{ij\,k\,l}: \text{appropriate range}\)

Couple this to the Standard Model by:

\[
SU(3) \times SU(2) \times U(1) \subset SU(N_F - N_C)
\]
Masses of gauginos, scalars, and gravitino come out to be phenomenologically attractive values, and the Landau pole problem can be avoided, if we choose:

\[ 10^8 \text{ GeV} \lesssim \mu \lesssim 10^9 \text{ GeV} \]
\[ 10^{13} \text{ GeV} \lesssim m \lesssim 10^{15} \text{ GeV} \]

\[ C_{ijke} : \text{appropriate range} \]
\[ (C^2 \sim m \Lambda^{-3}) \]
Masses of gauginos, scalars, and gravitino come out to be phenomenologically attractive values, and the Landau pole problem can be avoided, if we choose:

\[ 10^8 \text{ GeV} \leq \mu \leq 10^9 \text{ GeV} \]

\[ 10^{13} \text{ GeV} \leq m \leq 10^{15} \text{ GeV} \]

\( C_{ij}k : \text{appropriate range} \quad (C^2 \sim m^{-3}) \)
Masses of gauginos, scalars, and gravitino come out to be phenomenologically attractive values, and the Landau pole problem can be avoided, if we choose:

\[ 10^8 \text{ GeV} \leq \mu \leq 10^9 \text{ GeV} \]

\[ 10^{13} \text{ GeV} \leq m \leq 10^{15} \text{ GeV} \]

\[ C_{ij}k_{ej} : \text{appropriate range} \]

\[ (C^2 \sim m \Lambda^{-3}) \]
There have been model building activities making use of related ideas:

Murayama, Nomura (hep-ph/0612186, 0701231)
Csaki, Shirman, Terning (hep-ph/0612241)
Aharony, Seiberg (hep-ph/0612308)
Abel, Khoze (hep-ph/0701069)
Amariti, Girardello, Mariotti (hep-th/0701121)
Dudas, Mourad, Nitti (0706.1269)

......
Conclusion
Meta-stable vacua appear to be ubiquitous in field theories.

Accepting them allows greater flexibility in model building.

Realizing them in string theory is easier.

It may lead to new technical advances in string theory.
Meta-stable vacua appear to be ubiquitous in field theories.

Accepting them allows greater flexibility in model building.

Realizing them in string theory is easier.

It may lead to new technical advances in string theory.

How does the story change when the gravity is turned on?

How can we tell when they are not in the Swampland?