## Crossing Beyond Scattering Amplitudes

Hofie Sigridar Hannesdottir<br>Institute for Advanced Study

with Simon Caron-Huot, Mathieu Giroux and Sebastian Mizera

## Outline

1. Introduction

2. Crossing equation

3. What can be measured asymptotically?

4. Examples


## REVIEW ON CROSSING SYMMETRY

Amplitudes for $A B \rightarrow C D$ and $A \bar{C} \rightarrow \bar{B} D$ are boundary values of the same analytic function


$\mathcal{M}_{A B \rightarrow C D} \underset{\begin{array}{c}\text { Analytic } \\ \text { continuation }\end{array}}{\longleftrightarrow} \mathcal{M}_{A \bar{C} \rightarrow \bar{B} D}$

Particles indistinguishable from antiparticles traveling back in time?

## REVIEW ON CROSSING SYMMETRY

Amplitudes for $A B \rightarrow C D$ and $A \bar{C} \rightarrow \bar{B} D$ are boundary values of the same analytic function


Not relabeling or cyclic invariance

$$
\mathcal{M}_{A B \rightarrow C D} \underset{\begin{array}{c}
\text { Analytic } \\
\text { continuation }
\end{array}}{\longleftrightarrow} \mathcal{M}_{A \bar{C} \rightarrow \bar{B} D}
$$

Particles indistinguishable from antiparticles traveling back in time?

Crossing symmetry would allow us to use results from previous computations:



## Crossing symmetry in 2 to 2 Scattering

Proven for the non-perturbative amplitude at fixed momentum transfer $t<0$ in theories with mass gap


## Crossing symmetry in 2 to 2 Scattering

Proven for the non-perturbative amplitude at fixed momentum transfer $t<0$ in theories with mass gap


## Crossing symmetry in 2 to 3 scattering

Same for the 5 pt amplitude, right?



## Crossing symmetry in 2 to 3 scattering

Same for the 5 pt amplitude, right?



No.

## Crossing symmetry in 2 To 3 Scattering

The central topic of this talk:
What is the result of analytically continuing scattering amplitudes?


## Simple example at Tree level

$$
\mathcal{M}_{543 \leftarrow 21}={ }_{4}^{5}=\frac{g^{3}}{\left(s_{45}-m_{45}^{2}+i \varepsilon\right)\left(s_{13}-m_{13}^{2}\right)},
$$



We will take time
flowing to the left!

## Simple example at Tree level



Rotate $s_{13}$ in the lower half plane at fixed $s_{45}$


## Simple example at Tree level



Rotate $s_{13}$ in the lower half plane at fixed $s_{45}$


## Simple example at Tree level



Rotate $s_{13}$ in the lower half plane at fixed $s_{45}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
{\left[\mathcal{M}_{543 \leftarrow 21}\right]_{s_{13}} } & =\underbrace{\frac{g^{3}}{\left(s_{45}-m_{45}^{2}+i \varepsilon\right)\left(s_{13}-m_{13}^{2}-i \varepsilon\right)}}_{\mathcal{M}^{\dagger}} \\
& =\underbrace{\frac{g^{3}}{\left(s_{45}-m_{45}^{2}-i \varepsilon\right)\left(s_{13}-m_{13}^{2}-i \varepsilon\right)}}_{1}-\underbrace{2 \pi i \delta\left(s_{45}-m_{45}^{2}\right) \frac{g^{3}}{\left(s_{13}-m_{13}^{2}-i \varepsilon\right)}}_{\mathcal{M}_{3}^{2}}
\end{aligned}
$$

Takeaway point:
Analytic continuation from $\mathcal{M}$ lands on something new

## Here: Relate asymptotic observables

We will learn: Scattering amplitudes are part of a larger family of observables, related by analytic continuation


Crossing equation describes the result of analytic continuation

## Previous progress on crossing

- Proposed for quantum field theory in 1954
[Gell-Mann, Goldberger, Thirring]
- Proven for non-perturbative $2 \rightarrow 2$ and $2 \rightarrow 3$ scalar amplitudes, assuming mass gap
- Proofs use mass gap, causality, unitarity, and analytic extension theorems
[Bros, Epstein, Glaser 1964, 1965; Bros 1986]
- Recent progress in Chern-Simons theories and string theory for $2 \rightarrow 2$ amplitudes

> [See e.g. Jain, Mandlik, Minwalla, Takimi, Wadia, Yokoyama 2014; Lacroix, Erbin, Sen 2018; Mehta, Minwalla, Patel, Prakash, Sharma 2022; Gabai, Sandor, Yin 2022]

- Proven in the planar limit to any multiplicity using perturbation theory
[Mizera 2021]

Challenge: understand connection between crossing and physical principles

## Outline

1. Introduction

2. Crossing equation

3. What can be measured asymptotically?

4. Examples


## AsYmptotic ALgEBRA IN QUANTUM FIELD THEORY

1. Algebra of asymptotic measurements in the far past and far future,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& a_{\text {in }} \\
& a_{\text {out }} \\
& \left.\left[a_{1}, a_{2}^{\dagger}\right]=\delta_{1,2} 2 p_{1}^{0}(2 \pi)^{\mathrm{D}-1} \delta^{\mathrm{D}-1}\left(\vec{p}_{2}^{\dagger}\right]=\vec{p}_{2}\right) \\
& 1,22 p_{1}^{0}(2 \pi)^{\mathrm{D}-1} \delta^{\mathrm{D}-1}\left(\vec{p}_{1}-\vec{p}_{2}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

2. These operators act on equivalent Hilbert spaces and are related by a unitary evolution operator $S$ :

$$
b=S^{\dagger} a S, \quad b^{\dagger}=S^{\dagger} a^{\dagger} S ; \quad S S^{\dagger}=\mathbb{1}
$$

3. There exists a time-invariant vacuum $|0\rangle$ :

$$
a_{i}|0\rangle=b_{i}|0\rangle=0, \quad S|0\rangle=|0\rangle
$$

4. Stability:

$$
\left.S a_{i}^{\dagger}|0\rangle=a_{i}^{\dagger}|0\rangle\right\rangle_{20} \quad S b_{i}^{\dagger}|0\rangle=b_{i}^{\dagger}|0\rangle
$$

## AsYmptotic ALgEBRA IN QUANTUM FIELD THEORY

1. Algebra of asymptotic measurements in the far past and far future,
$\left.a_{\text {out }} \quad\left[a_{1}, a_{2}^{\dagger}\right]=\delta_{1,2} 2 p_{1}^{0}(2 \pi)^{\mathrm{D}-1} \delta^{\mathrm{D}-1}\left(\vec{p}_{1}-\vec{p}_{2}^{\dagger}\right)=\delta_{1,2} 2 p_{1}^{0}(2 \pi)^{\mathrm{D}-1} \delta^{\mathrm{D}-1}\left(\vec{p}_{1}-\vec{p}_{2}\right)\right\}$

Assume Bose/Fermi statistics, flat space, Poincaré invariance
2. These operators act on equivalent Hilbert spaces and are related by a unitary evolution operator $S$ :

$$
b=S^{\dagger} a S, \quad b^{\dagger}=S^{\dagger} a^{\dagger} S ; \quad S S^{\dagger}=\mathbb{1}
$$

3. There exists a time-invariant vacuum $|0\rangle$ :

$$
a_{i}|0\rangle=b_{i}|0\rangle=0, \quad S|0\rangle=|0\rangle
$$

4. Stability:

$$
S a_{i}^{\dagger}|0\rangle=a_{i}^{\dagger}|0\rangle, \quad S b_{i}^{\dagger}|0\rangle=b_{i}^{\dagger}|0\rangle
$$

Using this algebra,

What can be measured asymptotically?

## 4 PT ASYMPTOTIC MEASUREMENTS

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \langle 0| b_{4} b_{3} a_{2}^{\dagger} a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\mathrm{in}}\langle 43| S|21\rangle_{\mathrm{in}}=\begin{array}{l}
3 \nleftarrow \\
4 \\
\leftarrow
\end{array} \mathrm{H}_{2} \\
& \langle 0| a_{4} a_{3} b_{2}^{\dagger} b_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\mathrm{in}}\langle 43| S^{\dagger}|21\rangle_{\mathrm{in}}=3 \not 4 \leftarrow S^{\dagger} \leftarrow 1 \\
& \langle 0| a_{4} a_{3} a_{2}^{\dagger} a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\text {in }}\langle 43 \mid 21\rangle_{\text {in }} \quad=0 \\
& \langle 0| b_{4} b_{3} b_{2}^{\dagger} b_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\text {in }}\langle 43 \mid 21\rangle_{\text {in }} \quad=0
\end{aligned}
$$

## 4 PT ASYMPTOTIC MEASUREMENTS

$$
\begin{aligned}
& b=S^{\dagger} a S, \quad b^{\dagger}=S^{\dagger} a^{\dagger} S \\
& \langle 0| b_{4} b_{3} a_{2}^{\dagger} a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{i n}\langle 43| S|21\rangle_{\text {in }}=\begin{array}{l}
3 \leftarrow S \leftarrow{ }_{4}+2
\end{array} \\
& \langle 0| a_{4} a_{3} b_{2}^{\dagger} b_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\text {in }}\langle 43| S^{\dagger}|21\rangle_{\text {in }}=\begin{array}{l}
3 \leftarrow S^{\dagger} \leftarrow 1 \\
4 \leftarrow 2
\end{array} \\
& \langle 0| a_{4} a_{3} a_{2}^{\dagger} a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\text {in }}\langle 43 \mid 21\rangle_{\text {in }} \quad=0 \\
& \langle 0| b_{4} b_{3} b_{2}^{\dagger} b_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\text {in }}\langle 43 \mid 21\rangle_{\text {in }}=0
\end{aligned}
$$

Time flows to the left in all diagrams

## 5 PT ASYMPTOTIC MEASUREMENTS

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \langle 0| b_{5} b_{4} b_{3} a_{2}^{\dagger} a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\text {in }}\langle 543| S|21\rangle_{\text {in }}={ }_{3}^{4} \begin{array}{l}
3 \\
\langle 0| a_{5} a_{4} a_{3} b_{2}^{\dagger} b_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\text {in }}\langle 543| S^{\dagger}|21\rangle_{\text {in }}= \\
3 \\
4 \\
4
\end{array} S^{\ddagger}+1
\end{aligned}
$$

(plus forward terms and Hermitian conjugates)

## 5 PT ASYMPTOTIC MEASUREMENTS

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \langle 0| b_{5} b_{4} b_{3} a_{2}^{\dagger} a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\text {in }}\langle 543| S|21\rangle_{\text {in }}={ }_{5}^{3} \underset{5}{4} \underset{\leftarrow}{\leftarrow} S+2 \\
& \langle 0| a_{5} a_{4} a_{3} b_{2}^{\dagger} b_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\text {in }}\langle 543| S^{\dagger}|21\rangle_{\text {in }}={ }_{3}^{4} \begin{array}{l}
3 \\
5
\end{array} \underset{\leftarrow}{\leftarrow} S^{\dagger} \leftarrow 1 \\
& \langle 0| a_{5} a_{4} b_{3} a_{2}^{\dagger} a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\mathrm{in}}\langle 54| b_{3}|21\rangle_{\mathrm{in}}=4 \leftarrow S^{4} \text { ك } \\
& \langle 0| a_{5} a_{4} b_{3}^{\dagger} a_{2}^{\dagger} a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\mathrm{in}}\langle 54| b_{3}^{\dagger}|21\rangle_{\mathrm{in}}=\underset{5}{4} \underbrace{\leftarrow} S^{\dagger} X_{2}
\end{aligned}
$$

(plus forward terms and Hermitian conjugates)

## 5 PT ASYMPTOTIC MEASUREMENTS

$$
\begin{aligned}
&\langle 0| b_{5} b_{4} b_{3} a_{2}^{\dagger} a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\text {in }}\langle 543| S|21\rangle_{\mathrm{in}}= \\
& 4 \\
& 3 \\
&\langle 0| a_{5} a_{4} a_{3} b_{2}^{\dagger} b_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle={ }_{\mathrm{in}}\langle 543| S^{\dagger}|21\rangle_{\mathrm{in}}
\end{aligned}={ }_{4}^{3} \text { 5 }
$$

(plus forward terms and Hermitian conjugates)

## Example 6 PT ASYMPTOTIC MEASUREMENTS

$\langle 0| b_{6} b_{5} b_{4} a_{3}^{\dagger} a_{2}^{\dagger} a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle$


Scattering amplitudes


Inclusive amplitudes


Out-of-time-ordered correlators

## Example n-PT ASYMPTOTIC MEASUREMENTS

More generally:

$$
\langle 0| \underbrace{a \cdots a}_{k_{2 s}} S \underbrace{a^{\dagger} \cdots a^{\dagger}}_{k_{2 s-1}} \underbrace{a \cdots a}_{k_{2 s-2}} S^{\dagger} \cdots S^{\dagger} \underbrace{a^{\dagger} \cdots a^{\dagger}}_{k_{3}} \underbrace{a \cdots a}_{k_{2}} S \underbrace{a^{\dagger} \cdots a^{\dagger}}_{k_{1}}|0\rangle
$$

We expand in terms of connected components:


## PHYSICAL INTERPRETATION OF ASYMPTOTIC OBSERVABLES

$$
{ }_{\text {in }}\langle 0| b_{n} \cdots b_{j+1} a_{j}^{\dagger} \cdots a_{1}^{\dagger}|0\rangle_{\text {in }}: \text { Scattering amplitude }
$$

${ }_{\text {in }}\langle 54| b_{3}|21\rangle_{\text {in }}$ : Expectation value of electromagnetic field in a scattering experiment / Gravitational waveform detected by LIGO-Virgo-KAGRA

$$
\lim _{p_{3} \rightarrow p_{4}} \text { in }\langle 65| b_{4} b_{3}^{\dagger}|21\rangle_{\text {in }} \text { : Inclusive cross section / inclusive particle number }
$$

$$
\text { in }\langle 6| b_{5}^{\dagger} a_{4} b_{3}^{\dagger} a_{2}^{\dagger}|1\rangle_{\text {in }}: \text { Out-of-time-ordered correlator }
$$

## Takeaway points:

- S-matrix only one of exponentially many asymptotic observables
- Asymptotic observables are physical; already being measured and computed


## In this talk:

- Relate asymptotic observables to one another via analytic continuations


## Outline

1. Introduction

2. Crossing equation

3. What can be measured asymptotically?

4. Examples


## Contour of continuation

We propose an on-shell contour of analytic continuation which exchanges incoming and outgoing states with a parameter $z$

$$
\begin{array}{cc}
p_{b}^{\mu}(z)=\left(z p_{b}^{+}, \frac{1}{z} p_{b}^{-}, p_{b}^{\perp}\right), & p_{c}^{\mu}(z)=\left(z p_{c}^{+}, \frac{1}{z} p_{c}^{-}, p_{c}^{\perp}\right), \\
\text { for all } b \in B & \text { for all } c \in C
\end{array}
$$



## Crossing Path in Practice



Mixed invariants

rotate

Crossing Equation for 2-particle crossing:


## Crossing Equation for 2-particle crossing:



Minus sign from $S=\mathbb{1}+i(2 \pi)^{\mathrm{D}} \delta^{\mathrm{D}}\left(\Sigma p_{i}\right) \mathcal{M}$

## Crossing Equation for 2-particle crossing:



## Evidence:

- Loop-level examples and tree-level proof (part 4)
- Axiomatic quantum field theory, assuming analyticity, using microcausality

$$
\left[b, a^{\dagger}\right] \quad \text { Cross } \stackrel{\longleftrightarrow}{3} \leftrightarrow C \quad\left[b^{\dagger}, a\right]
$$

## Crossing Equation for 2-particle crossing:



Use microcausality $\mathcal{G}_{A B \rightarrow C D}-\mathcal{G}_{A C \rightarrow B D}=0$ :

$$
\left[b, a^{\dagger}\right] \quad \text { Cross } \overleftrightarrow{B} \leftrightarrow C \quad\left[b^{\dagger}, a\right]
$$

## Crossing proposal for multi-particle crossing:



## Crossing proposal for multi-particle crossing:



- Loop-level examples and tree-level proof (part 4)
- Symmetry in $A D$ \& $B C$


## Proving the crossing equation involves comparing:

(I)


The analytic continuation of $S$ via the prescribed path


Computing the corresponding observables explicitly

## Continuing Around singularities

Local analyticity can be subtle: might need to continue past anomalous thresholds


Expected from axiomatic field theory


## FAMILIES OF OBSERVABLES

1


2

3


O(O)CO
O(O)CO



## Outline

1. Introduction

2. Crossing equation

3. What can be measured asymptotically?

4. Examples


## Tree-Level example Revisited

$$
\mathcal{M}_{543 \leftarrow 21}={ }_{4}^{5}=\frac{g^{3}}{\left(s_{45}-m_{45}^{2}+i \varepsilon\right)\left(s_{13}-m_{13}^{2}\right)}
$$

(I) Analytic continuation path: $s_{13}$ rotates, $s_{45}$ stays fixed,

$$
\left[\mathcal{M}_{543 \leftarrow 21}\right]_{s_{13}}=\frac{g^{3}}{\left(s_{45}-m_{45}^{2}+i \varepsilon\right)\left(s_{13}-m_{13}^{2}-i \varepsilon\right)}
$$

(II) Crossing prediction: all ways of fitting


Allowed patterns:



Example disallowed patterns:

(II) Crossing prediction: all ways of fitting


Allowed patterns:


Comparing (I) and (II) verifies the crossing equation.

## Perturbation theory checks

- Checked all D-dim massless basis integrals for an expansion around $\mathrm{D}=4$

- Proof at any multiplicity at tree level (highly nontrivial)



## Crossing check for pentagon



$$
\begin{gathered}
{\left[\boldsymbol{I}_{0}^{(34 \rightarrow 215)}\right]_{2 \leftrightarrow 3}-\left[\boldsymbol{I}_{0}^{(24 \rightarrow 315)}\right]^{*}+\mathrm{Cut}_{s_{51}} \boldsymbol{I}_{0}^{(34 \rightarrow 215)} \stackrel{?}{=} 0} \\
{\left[\boldsymbol{I}_{0}^{(34 \rightarrow 215)}\right]_{2 \leftrightarrow 3}=\mathcal{P} \exp \left(\epsilon \int_{\gamma_{2 \leftrightarrow 3}} \mathrm{~d} \boldsymbol{\Omega}\right) \cdot \boldsymbol{I}_{0}^{(34 \rightarrow 215)}}
\end{gathered}
$$



$$
\operatorname{Cut}_{s_{51}} \boldsymbol{I}_{0}^{(34 \rightarrow 215)}=\left(\begin{array}{ccccc}
0 & 2 i \pi & 0 & -\frac{i \pi^{3}}{2} & -\frac{14}{3} i \pi \zeta_{3} \\
\mathbf{0}_{4} & \mathbf{0}_{4} & \mathbf{0}_{4} & \mathbf{0}_{4} & \mathbf{0}_{4} \\
0 & -4 i \pi & 0 & \frac{i \pi^{3}}{3} & \frac{28 i \pi \zeta_{3}}{3} \\
0 & -4 i \pi & 0 & \frac{i \pi^{3}}{3} & \frac{28 i \pi \zeta_{3}}{3} \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 4 i \pi & 0 & -\frac{i \pi^{3}}{3} & -\frac{28}{3} i \pi \zeta_{3} \\
\mathbf{0}_{2} & \mathbf{0}_{2} & \mathbf{0}_{2} & \mathbf{0}_{2} & \mathbf{0}_{2}
\end{array}\right) \cdot\left(\begin{array}{c}
1 \\
\epsilon \\
\epsilon^{2} \\
\epsilon^{3} \\
\epsilon^{4}
\end{array}\right)
$$

## Emission in black-hole scattering

Waveform in LIGO-Virgo-KAGRA obtained as an in-in expectation value

$$
\begin{aligned}
& { }_{\mathrm{in}}\langle 54| b_{3}|12\rangle_{\mathrm{in}}=\begin{array}{l}
\mathrm{BH} \\
\mathrm{BH}
\end{array} \mathrm{~S}^{\dagger} \text { X } \\
& \text { [Kosower, Maybee, O'Connell 2018] }
\end{aligned}
$$

Here, analytically continue the 5 -pt amplitude
 in one-loop computations

[See also Brandhuber, Brown, Chen, De Angelis, Gowdy, Travaglini 2023; Herderschee, Roiban, Teng 2023; Elkhidir, O'Connell, Sergola, Vazquez-Holm 2023]

## Conclusions

- Exponentially many asymptotic observables, e.g. gravitational waveforms, out-of-time-ordered correlators and in-in expectation values
- New version of crossing symmetry:
$S$-matrix contains a host of asymptotic observables which are related by analytic continuations between different channels



## Conclusions

- Exponentially many asymptotic observables, e.g. gravitational waveforms, out-of-time-ordered correlators and in-in expectation values
- New version of crossing symmetry:
$S$-matrix contains a host of asymptotic observables which are related by analytic continuations between different channels


Thanks!

